

# **Instructional Program Review 2019/20 UPDATE**

**Real Estate**

**Created on: 09/18/2019 11:18:00 AM PST  
Last Modified: 02/05/2020 03:17:26 PM PST**

# Table of Contents

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| <b>General Information</b>                             | <b>1</b>  |
| <b>2019/20 Instructional Program Review</b>            | <b>2</b>  |
| Submission Information and Updates (REQUIRED)          | 2         |
| Outcomes and Assessment (REQUIRED)                     | 2         |
| Program Analysis for Equity and Excellence (REQUIRED)  | 2         |
| Program Goals (REQUIRED)                               | 2         |
| Action Plans for Goals (REQUIRED)                      | 3         |
| Goal Status Report (REQUIRED)                          | 5         |
| <b>Request Forms</b>                                   | <b>9</b>  |
| Classified Position, BARC and Faculty Position Request | 9         |
| <b>Reviewers</b>                                       | <b>10</b> |
| Liaison's Review                                       | 10        |
| Manager's Review                                       | 10        |
| <b>Appendix</b>  | <b>11</b> |

## **General Information (Instructional Program Review 2019/20 UPDATE)**

---

## 2019/20 Instructional Program Review

### SUBMISSION INFORMATION AND UPDATES (REQUIRED)

- Name of Lead Writer: Eduardo Landeros
- Name of Liaison: Bridget Herrin
- Department Chair: Mark Abajian and Tara Maciel
- Name of Manager/Service Area Supervisor: Danene Brown
- Is this a CTE program? (State Yes or No): Yes

### OUTCOMES AND ASSESSMENT (REQUIRED)

**Form:** 2019/20 Program Review Outcomes and Assessment Section (See appendix)

### PROGRAM ANALYSIS FOR EQUITY AND EXCELLENCE (REQUIRED)

**Form:** 2019/20 Program Review Instructional Program Analysis Section (See appendix)

#### File Attachments:

1. Enrollment - Real Estate Fill Rates.pdf
2. Enrollment - Real Estate FTES.pdf
3. Program GPA - All.pdf
4. Program GPA - Real Estate.pdf
5. Real Estate Industry Report IBIS.pdf
6. Retention Rate - All.pdf
7. Retention Rate - Real Estate - African American.pdf
8. Retention Rate - Real Estate.pdf
9. Success Rate - All - Ages 18-29.pdf
10. Success Rate - All.pdf
11. Success Rate - Real Estate - African American.pdf
12. Success Rate - Real Estate - Hispanic.pdf
13. Success Rate - Real Estate.pdf

### PROGRAM GOALS (REQUIRED)

#### Real Estate Program Goal Set 2018-2019

##### Career Pathways

Broaden and enhance career exploration and planning by offering new real estate courses such as Mortgage Loan

Brokering and Lending (3.00 units) and Alternative Careers in Real Estate (1.00 unit) to allow students to explore divergent opportunities to widen student perspectives of the industry.

### Mapping

**CA- Mesa College Strategic Directions and Goals:** Strategic Goal 1.1, Strategic Goal 1.2, Strategic Goal 1.4, Strategic Goal 4.1, Strategic Goal 4.2,

**CTE 2018/19:** Strong Workforce Recommendation 2, Strong Workforce Recommendation 3, Strong Workforce Recommendation 7, Strong Workforce Recommendation 8, Strong Workforce Recommendation 9,

**Institutional Learning Outcomes 2016/17:** Communication, Critical Thinking, Information Literacy, Professional & Ethical Behavior

### Student Success

Develop work-based real estate internship program.

### Mapping

**CA- Mesa College Strategic Directions and Goals:** Strategic Goal 1.4, Strategic Goal 3.2, Strategic Goal 3.3,

**CTE 2018/19:** Strong Workforce Recommendation 1, Strong Workforce Recommendation 7,

**Institutional Learning Outcomes 2016/17:** Communication, Critical Thinking, Information Literacy, Professional & Ethical Behavior

### Professional Development

Provide professional development opportunities for CTE adjunct faculty to maintain industry and program relevance and provide registration fees and travel reimbursement up to \$2,000 per adjunct per academic year.

### Mapping

**CA- Mesa College Strategic Directions and Goals:** Strategic Goal 1.1, Strategic Goal 1.6, Strategic Goal 2.1, Strategic Goal 2.3, Strategic Goal 4.1, Strategic Goal 4.2, Strategic Goal 5.1, Strategic Goal 5.2,

**CTE 2018/19:** Strong Workforce Recommendation 11, Strong Workforce Recommendation 15, Strong Workforce Recommendation 9,

**Institutional Learning Outcomes 2016/17:** Communication, Critical Thinking, Global Consciousness, Information Literacy, Professional & Ethical Behavior

## ACTION PLANS FOR GOALS (REQUIRED)

### Actions

#### Real Estate Program Goal Set 2018-2019

Goal

#### Goal: Career Pathways

Broaden and enhance career exploration and planning by offering new real estate courses such as Mortgage Loan Brokering and Lending (3.00 units) and Alternative Careers in Real Estate (1.00 unit) to allow students to explore

divergent opportunities to widen student perspectives of the industry.

**Action:** Dean Brown discussion

|   |  |
|---|--|
| <b>Describe the actions needed to achieve this objective:</b>   | Have a discussion with Dean Brown to determine if there is a need to create these courses. Therefore if there is a need, identify the process within Mesa College to create such courses and to select potential Faculty members who could facilitate these courses. |
| <b>Who will be responsible for overseeing the completion of this objective:</b>   | Eduardo Landeros   |
| <b>Provide a timeline for the actions:</b>  | Spring 2020  |
| <b>Describe the assessment plan you will use to know if the objective was achieved and effective:</b>   | Identify time and date of meeting.   |
| <b>List resources needed to achieve this objective and associated costs (Supplies, Equipment, Computer Equipment, Travel &amp; Conference, Software, Facilities, Classified Staff, Faculty, Other):</b> | N/A  |

**Goal: Student Success**

Develop work-based real estate internship program.

**Action:** Discussion with Career Technical Education's Associate Dean Monica Romero

|   |   |
|---|---|
| <b>Describe the actions needed to achieve this objective:</b>   | Have a discussion with Associate Dean Romero to identify the process within Mesa College to offer these internships and to select potential Employers and Faculty members who could facilitate these courses. |
| <b>Who will be responsible for overseeing the completion of this objective:</b>                       | Eduardo Landeros  |
| <b>Provide a timeline for the actions:</b>  | Spring 2020   |
| <b>Describe the assessment plan you will use to know if the objective was achieved and effective:</b> | Identify date and time of meeting.  |
| <b>List resources needed to achieve this objective and associated costs (Supplies,</b>                | N/A   |

Equipment, Computer  
Equipment, Travel &  
Conference, Software,  
Facilities, Classified Staff,  
Faculty, Other):

**Goal: Professional Development**

Provide professional development opportunities for CTE adjunct faculty to maintain industry and program relevance and provide registration fees and travel reimbursement up to \$2,000 per adjunct per academic year.

**Action:** Dean and Business Department Co-Chairs discussion

**Describe the actions needed to achieve this objective:** Have a discussion with Dean Brown and Co-Chairs Tara Maciel and Mark Abajian to determine if a portion of our Department travel funds could be set aside to finance Real Estate conference and events for Adjunct Faculty, aside from what Mesa's Travel Committee already offers.

**Who will be responsible for overseeing the completion of this objective:** Eduardo Landeros

**Provide a timeline for the actions:** Spring 2020

**Describe the assessment plan you will use to know if the objective was achieved and effective:** Identify the date and time of meeting.

**List resources needed to achieve this objective and associated costs (Supplies, Equipment, Computer Equipment, Travel & Conference, Software, Facilities, Classified Staff, Faculty, Other):** N/A

**GOAL STATUS REPORT (REQUIRED)**

**Action Statuses**

**Real Estate Program Goal Set 2018-2019**

Goal

**Goal: Career Pathways**

Broaden and enhance career exploration and planning by offering new real estate courses such as Mortgage Loan

Brokering and Lending (3.00 units) and Alternative Careers in Real Estate (1.00 unit) to allow students to explore divergent opportunities to widen student perspectives of the industry.

**Action:** Dean Brown discussion

|   |  |
|---|--|
| <b>Describe the actions needed to achieve this objective:</b>   | Have a discussion with Dean Brown to determine if there is a need to create these courses. Therefore if there is a need, identify the process within Mesa College to create such courses and to select potential Faculty members who could facilitate these courses. |
| <b>Who will be responsible for overseeing the completion of this objective:</b>   | Eduardo Landeros   |
| <b>Provide a timeline for the actions:</b>  | Spring 2020  |
| <b>Describe the assessment plan you will use to know if the objective was achieved and effective:</b>   | Identify time and date of meeting.   |
| <b>List resources needed to achieve this objective and associated costs (Supplies, Equipment, Computer Equipment, Travel &amp; Conference, Software, Facilities, Classified Staff, Faculty, Other):</b> | N/A  |

Status for Dean Brown discussion

|  |   |
|--|---|
| <b>Current Status:</b>   | In Progress   |
| <b>If the Current Status was marked Completed, what was the impact of the completed objective on your program:</b> | N/A   |
| <b>If the Current Status was not marked Completed, what are the implications and next steps:</b>                   | None, Waiting to meet with Dean Brown. in the Spring of 2020. |

**Goal: Student Success**

Develop work-based real estate internship program.

**Action:** Discussion with Career Technical Education's Associate Dean Monica Romero



|   |   |
|---|---|
| <b>Describe the actions needed to achieve this objective:</b>   | Have a discussion with Associate Dean Romero to identify the process within Mesa College to offer these internships and to select potential Employers and Faculty members who could facilitate these courses. |
| <b>Who will be responsible for overseeing the completion of this objective:</b>   | Eduardo Landeros  |
| <b>Provide a timeline for the actions:</b>  | Spring 2020   |
| <b>Describe the assessment plan you will use to know if the objective was achieved and effective:</b>   | Identify date and time of meeting.  |
| <b>List resources needed to achieve this objective and associated costs (Supplies, Equipment, Computer Equipment, Travel &amp; Conference, Software, Facilities, Classified Staff, Faculty, Other):</b> | N/A   |

Status for Discussion with Career Technical Education's Associate Dean Monica Romero

|  |  |
|--|--|
| <b>Current Status:</b>   | In Progress  |
| <b>If the Current Status was marked Completed, what was the impact of the completed objective on your program:</b> | N/A  |
| <b>If the Current Status was not marked Completed, what are the implications and next steps:</b>                   | None, Waiting to meet with Associate Dean Romero. in the Spring of 2020. |

**Goal: Professional Development**

Provide professional development opportunities for CTE adjunct faculty to maintain industry and program relevance and provide registration fees and travel reimbursement up to \$2,000 per adjunct per academic year.

**Action:** Dean and Business Department Co-Chairs discussion

|   |  |
|---|--|
| <b>Describe the actions needed to achieve this objective:</b> | Have a discussion with Dean Brown and Co-Chairs Tara Maciel and Mark Abajian to determine if a portion of our Department travel funds could be set aside to finance Real Estate conference and events for Adjunct Faculty, aside from what Mesa's Travel Committee already offers. |
|---|--|

|   |  |
|---|--|
| <b>Who will be responsible for overseeing the completion of this objective:</b>   | Eduardo Landeros                       |
| <b>Provide a timeline for the actions:</b>  | Spring 2020                            |
| <b>Describe the assessment plan you will use to know if the objective was achieved and effective:</b>   | Identify the date and time of meeting. |
| <b>List resources needed to achieve this objective and associated costs (Supplies, Equipment, Computer Equipment, Travel &amp; Conference, Software, Facilities, Classified Staff, Faculty, Other):</b> | N/A                                    |

Status for Dean and Business Department Co-Chairs discussion

|  |  |
|--|--|
| <b>Current Status:</b>   | In Progress  |
| <b>If the Current Status was marked Completed, what was the impact of the completed objective on your program:</b> | N/A  |
| <b>If the Current Status was not marked Completed, what are the implications and next steps:</b>                   | None, Waiting to meet with Dean Brown and Co-Chairs in the Spring of 2020. |

## Request Forms

---

**CLASSIFIED POSITION, BARC AND FACULTY POSITION REQUEST**

## Reviewers

---

### LIAISON'S REVIEW

**Form:** Instructional Program Liaison's Review 2019/20 UPDATE

### MANAGER'S REVIEW

**Form:** Instructional Program Manager's Review 2019/20 UPDATE

---

# Appendix

- 
- A. **2019/20 Program Review Outcomes and Assessment Section** (Form)
  - B. **2019/20 Program Review Instructional Program Analysis Section** (Form)
-

# Form: "2019/20 Program Review Outcomes and Assessment Section"

**Created with :** Taskstream

**Participating Area:** Real Estate

## **(REQUIRED) Program name**

Real Estate

## **(REQUIRED) Are you on target with your assessment schedule?**

Yes. Real Estate courses 101 (Real Estate Principles), 115 (Real Estate Finance), 110 (Principles of Real Estate Appraisal), 130 (Real Property Management) and 125 (Real Estate Economics) were all assessed during Spring of 2019. In addition, Real Estate courses 105 (Legal Aspects of Real Estate) and 120 (Real Estate Practice) were also assessed in Spring of 2018. Only one class, Real 111 Introduction to Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice, has not been assessed but this is due to the fact that this class is currently in an Inactive status.

## **(REQUIRED) What have your assessments revealed about your courses/programs/service area/school/division/office?**

In general, all course evaluations described above met or surpassed the minimum CLO benchmark. However, there is always room for improvement. Discussions among faculty revealed that the use of research-based projects in the classroom is beneficial to online students because it gives them the opportunity to go beyond the readings and book assignments and learn more about the Real Estate industry which is critical to their success in the market. Because the vast majority of Real Estate courses are offered online, online formats were discussed in detail. Faculty also discussed the need for professional development among faculty and how to improve their online courses. There are currently many courses being offered online that could benefit the program as a whole and make online courses more interactive. Being active and present in all online courses, rather than just offering self-taught courses, was the consensus among all course assessment findings.

## **(REQUIRED) Based on your assessments, what resource needs have you identified?**

The use of technology like Zoom and Flipgrid was discussed as way to make the classes more interactive. Zoom can be used to virtually meet with students on a one-on-one basis and/or offer a conference video call with the class. Problems with schedules and student availability will always be an issue with online courses but it could still be offered to students as long as it is recorded and posted on Canvas for future use. Flipgrid is an online platform that allows students to submit videos and participate in a group online conversation. Flipgrid is a great way for students to practice their 30 second elevator pitch which essential in the Real Estate industry.

## **Please provide any other comments.**

N/A

# Form: "2019/20 Program Review Instructional Program Analysis Section"

Created with : Taskstream

Participating Area: Real Estate

## Program Name

---

**(REQUIRED) Type your program name.**

Real Estate

**Part A: In this section, please analyze your program in terms of course success metric. Start by disaggregating the available data by race, gender, and any other parameters of interest to your program and answer the following questions.**

---

**(REQUIRED) A1. What patterns do you notice with regard to equity in course success at the program level by race/ethnicity?**

You may also conduct analysis by course and/or by modality.

Equity Gap: When a group of students who share a common characteristic (e.g. race/ethnicity) have lower access and/or outcome rates than their peers. The size of the equity gap along with the size of the group determine whether that gap is significant. Larger groups should, statistically, have smaller gaps and therefore when gaps are present (even small ones) they may be significant. Smaller groups will see wider variation in outcomes, therefore gaps should be seen consistently over time and/or reviewed by looking at multiple years in aggregate to determine if they are significant.

### SUCCESS RATES

Across all disciplines the success rate appears to be consistent over the past five years at an average of 72%. However, when we analyze success rates within the Real Estate Program this number decreases to 64%.

### RETENTION RATES

Across all disciplines the retention rate appears to be consistent over the past five years at an average of 87%. However, when we analyze retention rates within the Real Estate Program this number decreases to 84%.

### EQUITY GAP ANALYSIS

When analyzing campuswide data among ethnicities, success rates within the African American community seemed to be the lowest at 63% (50% in Real Estate) followed by Hispanics at 68% (61% in Real Estate), White at 76% (65% in Real Estate) and Asians at 79% (69% in Real Estate). Student ages also made a difference. When comparing age ranges and success rates, 71% of students ages 18-29 tend to complete courses across all disciplines but only 60% complete courses in the Real Estate Program. However, when increasing the age range to 30-50+ success rates across all disciplines goes up to 75% and

within the Real Estate Program it jumps to 68%. Gender classifications also demonstrate variances when compared to the average. Across all disciplines, 70% of men and 74% of women tend to complete the courses compared to the average of 72%. In terms of retention rates, Males and Females tend to fall close to the average. However, the African American community falls to an 83% retention rate across all disciplines and 79% in the Real Estate Program while the Hispanic community falls to 85% retention rate across all disciplines and 81% in the Real Estate Program.

For more information, please see attachments.

**(REQUIRED) A2. Do these patterns persist over time (e.g., look at the last five years)? Describe if equity gaps are increasing, decreasing, or staying the same?**

Success rates across all disciplines are close to the average of 72% within the past five years. However, when we analyze Real Estate success rates over the past five years we can see that these numbers fluctuate. For example in the year 2014/2015 the Real Estate program had a success rate of 66%, while in 2015/2016 this number dropped significantly to 62%, and to 61% in 2016/2017. In 2017/2018 it started to increase to 67% but in 2018/2019 it decreased to 66%. Nonetheless, it is important to analyze and determine the reason why these numbers are low compared to other disciplines across campus. Coincidentally, when analyzing campuswide average GPA among Real Estate students, this number falls from an average of 2.64 in 2014/2015 to 2.49 in 2015/2016 and 2.54 in 2016/2017 increasing significantly to 2.81 in 2017/2018 and 2.75 in 2018/2019.

In addition, success rates in the African American population in the Real Estate Program dropped dramatically in 2016/2017 from 59-60% in 2014-2016 to 41% in 2016/2017. Moreover, retention rates in the Real Estate programs show that African Americans had a sharp decline from 2016-2017 to 2017/2018 from 78% to 72%.

**(REQUIRED) A3. What factors may have influenced these results? What are your most significant findings?**

The Real Estate industry tends to be cyclical and tied to the country's economic performance and interest policies. After the most recent recession period we experienced from 2008 to about 2013, things did not start to pick up until 2014 and 2015, according to Zillow.com, and that's when students might have decided to explore the Real Estate industry and become sales agents. Census enrollment data shows that between 2015-2017 enrollment numbers spiked to about 565-622 when the average enrollment per semester, in the past few years, had been about 480-500. This might explain the reason why success rates dropped in general from 66% in 2014/2015 to 62% and 61% from 2015-2017 as more students entered the program but many may have decided to drop the idea of becoming a Real Estate agent after exploring other career options or seeing how the political environment across the country was affecting the industry. Also, Presidential elections in 2016 did not help the industry. On average, Presidential elections tend to negatively affect the real estate industry as investors stay on the sidelines and do not invest in Real Estate as they are waiting to see what direction the country is going to take.

**(REQUIRED) A4. How have you/might you alter practices to increase student success and reduce equity gaps?**

Faculty need to constantly remind students, specifically those that come from Low to Moderate Income areas and/or are identified as Hispanics or African American, about all the



resources that Mesa College has to offer. In my opinion, a lot of these students struggle financially and are often faced with the decision of going to school or working and many come from low-income households where education is just not a priority. In addition, many Hispanic and African American students who graduate from high school tend to use their connections and follow their friends and family members into a blue collar job because it is easy to get and there's no one guiding them since most of them are first generation college students. Letting go of a good paying job and sacrificing four to five years of their lives is just not appealing to them. Nonetheless, Mesa College offers many resources like the Stand, EOPS, Financial Aid, Farmers Market, Puente, Latinx Programs, Avanza Center and access to paying internships among other things that could potentially help these students continue with their school and be successful. The more Faculty communicate these programs to their classes, the more probabilities of success these students are going to have.

**(REQUIRED) A5. How does your program contribute to the College's identity of being a Hispanic Serving Institution?**

As previously mentioned, Hispanic students tend to prioritize getting a job right out of High School rather than going to college so the Real Estate program is perfect for this demographic. There are many Hispanic students who do not want to spend four or five years in college, for financial reasons, so they look for an alternative and try to find education/career programs that can be completed in less than two years. Many students also value an education and know that in order to avoid blue collar jobs, they have to get some formal education. Fortunately, Mesa's Real Estate program offers all the classes needed to get licensed in California and students can potentially satisfy this requirement by attending Mesa College for one or two semesters. By taking just three classes (Real Estate Principles, Real Estate Practice and an elective which can be Business Law or Accounting), students are eligible to take the Salesperson Real Estate exam. Moreover, Real Estate agents who are currently practicing and want to become Brokers can also attend Mesa College and take a few more Real Estate classes and be eligible to take the Real Estate Brokers' exam within one or two years; this also brings students closer to obtaining an Associates of Science Degree in Real Estate if they complete a few more elective classes which they can then use as a competitive advantage in the market.

**(REQUIRED) A6. Have you identified resource needs? If yes, please list.**

The Real Estate world is an industry that is constantly evolving and Faculty need to be up to date on market and economic trends that can make them better Real Estate professionals and educators. Therefore, having a travel budget dedicated specifically for Adjunct Real Estate Faculty to attend Real Estate conferences and events would be ideal and benefit students tremendously.

**(REQUIRED) A7. Do any of your program goals address these implications or needs? If not, please develop a new goal that addresses your findings and subsequent reflection.**

Yes, goal #3:

Professional Development

Provide professional development opportunities for CTE adjunct faculty to maintain industry and program relevance and provide registration fees and travel reimbursement up to \$2,000 per adjunct per academic year.

**Part B: In this section, look at the area of focus you identified in last year's program review and answer the following questions.**

---

**(REQUIRED) B1. How have you developed this focus? Are you seeing any results? What are your next steps?**

During the Fall of 2019, Prof. Eduardo Landeros took over the Real Estate program so he's in the process of developing an action plan that could help us achieve our goals. Action items have been added to Program Review and during Spring 2020 we will have more information to move forward and be able to meet our goals.